



APAI Project No: 0600-030-01

May 9, 2019

Mr. John Espinoza, P.E., C.P.M.
Project Engineer
City of San Marcos – Capital Improvements/Engineering
630 E. Hopkins Street
San Marcos, Texas 78666

Via E-Mail: jespinoza@sanmarcostx.gov

Re: Bid Evaluation - Surface Water Treatment Plant Low Water Crossing Improvements
#219-236

Dear Mr. Espinoza:

Alan Plummer Associates, Inc. (APAI) has completed the bid evaluation for the Surface Water Treatment Plant Low Water Crossing Improvements Project. The Bid Tabulation is provided as Attachment A: Bid Tabulation.

The City received a total of nine (9) bids on May 2, 2019, as summarized below:

Bidder	Total Bid	Difference Compared to Low Bid	
Westar Construction, Inc.	\$192,940.50	-	-
JBS Underground LLC	\$231,119.36*	\$38,178.86	19.8%
Lone Star Sitework	\$232,367.60	\$39,427.10	20.4%
Casto Lopez Concrete LLC	\$236,536.29*	\$43,595.79	22.6%
Myers Concrete Construction, LP	\$244,994.47	\$52,053.97	27.0%
Digg Commercial, LLC	\$249,573.00	\$56,632.50	29.4%
SAMES	\$298,901.64	\$105,961.14	54.9%
Blackcastle General Contractor	\$325,225.00	\$132,284.50	68.6%
AARON Concrete Contractors, LP	\$338,727.00	\$145,786.50	75.6%
Average	\$261,153.87	\$76,740.05	39.8%

* Bidder's cost varied slightly from their submitted cost. The amount shown should be recognized as the corrected amount.

Westar Construction, Inc. is the apparent low bidder with a total bid amount of \$192,940.50.



Evaluation of Bids

All bidders submitted their bids per the requirements of the Bid Form, Addenda No. 1, and No. 2.

APAI evaluated the apparent lowest bidder's ability to perform the intended scope of work. The criterion included:

1. Bidder's submitted bid amount;
2. Statement of Bidder's Qualifications; and
3. Validation of Bidder's references.

Additionally, if any discrepancy led to a change in the apparent low bidder or a significant requirement was not met that would be cause to reject a bid or cause to deem a bid non-responsive or irregular, the next lowest apparent bidder was evaluated.

APAI reviewed the submitted Bid Form; applicable Bid Bond; Statement of Bidder's Qualifications; project experience; and subcontractor contacts for Westar Construction, Inc., the apparent low bidder for this contract.

1. **Bid Form:** The total submitted bid from Westar Construction, Inc., was balanced and Westar Construction, Inc., remains the apparent low bidder.
2. **Bid Bond:** Westar Construction, Inc.'s, bid bond form was reviewed by APAI and was found to be in line with those submitted by all other bidders.
3. **Bidder's Indebtedness to Owner:** APAI is not privy to Westar Construction, Inc.'s, current financial indebtedness it may have with the City. The City's Finance Director, or other personnel, should be able to confirm any lapses on the Contractor's part to comply with this requirement.
4. **Statement of Bidder's Qualifications:** APAI found two questions within the forms that Westar Construction, Inc., did not meet the minimum requirements for. 1) Question 23 – only 1 project met the requirements; however, this either exceeded or similar to the majority of other bidders. 2) Question 25 – none of Westar Construction, Inc.'s, current projects have a cost in excess of \$1M; however, this is similar to the majority of all bidders. No concerns were noted by APAI.
5. **Project Experience:** Westar Construction, Inc., listed references as part of their project experience responses (*Projects awarded During the Last 5 Years*). APAI was successful in speaking with five (5) of listed references. A majority of the references had no listed description of past work performed that matches the proposed scope of work (culvert replacement; concrete flatwork; regrading; etc.) associated with this project.



The following summarizes our findings from the five reference checks:

NO.	PROJECT	CONTACT	LISTED EXPERIENCE	NOTES
1	Richards Park Flatwork Improvements – City of Brady	Dennis Jobe, Parks Director	Concrete flatwork, trails	Contact indicated outstanding work done by contractor; recommends.
2	Old McDade Rd. Culvert Replacement Project – Bastrop County	Myles Milburn, Road & Bridge Superintendent Pct. 4	Replace road crossing, install culverts	Contact indicated outstanding work done by contractor; recommends.
3	San Gabriel Park Improvements Phase 1 – City of Georgetown	Dave Melass, LSA-PM	Waterlines, trails, water utilities, culvert installations, drainage channel, sidewalks, vertical infrastructure.	Contact had reservations about vertical work contractor has performed. Highly recommends them for concrete and flatwork.
4	Brushy Creek Regional Trail Repair – Williamson County, TX	Randy Bell, Park Director	Remove and replace concrete trail and retaining wall	Contact would recommend again for flatwork, but isn't certain for other type of work. No immediate reservations.
5	Pecan St. Culvert Replacement Project	Scott Murrah, BSP Engineers	Replace drainage structure under city road	Contact provided excellent recommendation; would hire again.

Based upon the Statement of Experience project references, Westar Construction, Inc., as an *Organization*, has primarily specialized in trails and flatwork projects, and has not completed at least five similar projects that are equal to or greater in size and magnitude with cost exceeding \$1M within the last 5 years.

The next lowest bid, submitted by JBS Underground, is 19.8% higher than the apparent low bidder. JBS Underground does not have any experience with the City of San Marcos but did include past project experiences with a majority of projects in site work and water taps.



Summary and Recommendation

Although Westar Construction, Inc., as an organization, does not meet the minimum experience requirement of having completed at least five similar projects that are equal to or greater in size and magnitude with a cost that exceeds \$1M within the last 5 years, APAI recommends that the City consider proceeding with award of the Surface Water Treatment Plant Low Water Crossing Road Improvements, #219-236, to Westar Construction, Inc., based on the following:

- No unfavorable references or reports of unacceptable performance were provided by any of the references, and in fact, references indicated that Westar Construction, Inc., was responsive and conducted business with professionalism;
- Outstanding recommendations from references with projects similar to the Surface Water Treatment Plant Low Water Crossing Road Improvements Project; and
- Westar Construction, Inc.'s list of past project experience and references that includes projects of similar scope to the Surface Water Treatment Plant Low Water Crossing Road Improvements Project.

If you have any questions about the bid evaluation or the project, please contact me at 210.510.1278 and jguerra@apaienv.com. We look forward to assisting the City with this important project.

Very truly yours,

ALAN PLUMMER ASSOCIATES, INC.

Jesse R. Guerra, Jr., P.E.
Senior Project Manager

Attachment A: Tabulation of Bids

TABULATED BY: TRAVIS RAMOS, EIT ALAN PLUMMER ASSOCIATES, INC. BID DATE: Thursday, May 2, 2019				TABULATION OF BIDS SURFACE WATER TREATMENT PLANT LOW WATER CROSSING IMPROVEMENTS - #219-236 CITY OF SAN MARCOS, TX										ENGINEER'S ESTIMATE:				\$225,000			
				<i>Westar Construction, Inc. 4500 Williams Dr. Ste. 212-PMB 411 Georgetown, TX 78633</i>		<i>JBS Underground, LLC 14202 Fort Smith Trail Austin, TX 78734</i>		<i>Lone Star Sitework PO Box 1867 Wimberley, TX 78676</i>		<i>Casto Lopez Concrete LLC 1955 FM 2001 Ste. 200 Buda, TX 78610</i>		<i>Myers Concrete Construction, LP PO Box 2928 Wimberley, TX 78676</i>		<i>Digg Commercial, LLC 829 Bastrop Hwy Austin, TX 78741</i>		<i>SAMES 200 S. 10th St Ste. 1500 McAllen, TX 78501</i>		<i>Blackcastle General Contractors 2115 Stephens Pl., Ste. 210 New Braunfels, TX 78130</i>		<i>AARON Concrete Contractors, LP PO Box 27107 Austin, TX 78755</i>	
ITEM NO.	DESCRIPTION	UNIT	EST. QTY.	UNIT PRICE	UNIT TOTAL	UNIT PRICE	UNIT TOTAL	UNIT PRICE	UNIT TOTAL	UNIT PRICE	UNIT TOTAL	UNIT PRICE	UNIT TOTAL	UNIT PRICE	UNIT TOTAL	UNIT PRICE	UNIT TOTAL	UNIT PRICE	UNIT TOTAL	UNIT PRICE	UNIT TOTAL
1	Preparing Right-of-way (removing and relocating existing utilities)	LS	1	\$15,000.00	\$15,000.00	\$10,031.60	\$10,031.60	\$8,900.00	\$8,900.00	\$55,229.00	\$55,229.00	\$19,293.30	\$19,293.30	\$36,241.00	\$36,241.00	\$8,806.98	\$8,806.98	\$16,600.00	\$16,600.00	\$25,000.00	\$25,000.00
2	Clearing and Grubbing	AC	0.44	\$15,000.00	\$6,600.00	\$18,050.45	\$7,942.20	\$5,000.00	\$2,200.00	\$52,637.00	\$23,160.28	\$26,436.30	\$11,631.97	\$15,000.00	\$6,600.00	\$6,808.47	\$2,995.73	\$13,900.00	\$6,116.00	\$15,000.00	\$6,600.00
3	Remove Concrete Riprap/Pavement	SF	4546	\$3.00	\$13,638.00	\$2.42	\$11,001.32	\$6.10	\$27,730.60	\$4.35	\$19,775.10	\$4.80	\$21,820.80	\$4.50	\$20,457.00	\$6.10	\$27,730.60	\$11.00	\$50,006.00	\$5.00	\$22,730.00
4	Flexible Base	CY	45	\$75.00	\$3,375.00	\$328.32	\$14,774.40	\$493.00	\$22,185.00	\$123.11	\$5,539.95	\$270.80	\$12,186.00	\$323.00	\$14,535.00	\$880.70	\$39,631.50	\$400.00	\$18,000.00	\$500.00	\$22,500.00
5	Controlled Low Strength Material	CY	150	\$270.00	\$40,500.00	\$190.13	\$28,519.50	\$160.00	\$24,000.00	\$216.63	\$32,494.50	\$205.70	\$30,855.00	\$70.00	\$10,500.00	\$208.66	\$31,299.00	\$250.00	\$37,500.00	\$168.00	\$25,200.00
6	Type II Concrete Driveway	SF	2560	\$12.00	\$30,720.00	\$12.48	\$31,948.80	\$11.90	\$30,464.00	\$9.60	\$24,576.00	\$10.74	\$27,494.40	\$8.55	\$21,888.00	\$21.01	\$53,785.60	\$12.00	\$30,720.00	\$23.00	\$58,880.00
7	Pipe, 36" Dia. RCP	LF	186	\$120.00	\$22,320.00	\$241.40	\$44,900.40	\$283.00	\$52,638.00	\$137.07	\$25,495.02	\$172.54	\$32,092.44	\$202.00	\$37,572.00	\$338.73	\$63,003.78	\$223.00	\$41,478.00	\$256.00	\$47,616.00
8	Concrete Riprap	CY	48	\$300.00	\$14,400.00	\$712.66	\$34,207.68	\$550.00	\$26,400.00	\$341.27	\$16,380.96	\$737.69	\$35,409.12	\$370.00	\$17,760.00	\$88.07	\$4,227.36	\$600.00	\$28,800.00	\$982.00	\$47,136.00
9	Sodding for Erosion Control	SY	75	\$6.00	\$450.00	\$39.85	\$2,988.75	\$8.00	\$600.00	\$34.47	\$2,585.25	\$21.59	\$1,619.25	\$105.00	\$7,875.00	\$16.26	\$1,219.50	\$25.00	\$1,875.00	\$15.00	\$1,125.00
10	Native Seeding for Erosion Control, Hydromulch	SY	2500	\$6.00	\$15,000.00	\$1.12	\$2,800.00	\$2.05	\$5,125.00	\$1.00	\$2,500.00	\$1.73	\$4,325.00	\$4.00	\$10,000.00	\$4.07	\$10,175.00	\$1.00	\$2,500.00	\$1.00	\$2,500.00
11	Soil Retention Blanket Class I, Type C	SY	2500	\$0.75	\$1,875.00	\$3.57	\$8,925.00	\$1.26	\$3,150.00	\$1.50	\$3,750.00	\$4.69	\$11,725.00	\$2.00	\$5,000.00	\$3.05	\$7,625.00	\$10.00	\$25,000.00	\$2.00	\$5,000.00
12	Protective Fencing Type A Chain Link Fence (Typical Application-High Damage Potential)	LF	250	\$5.00	\$1,250.00	\$12.70	\$3,175.00	\$15.00	\$3,750.00	\$4.00	\$1,000.00	\$6.40	\$1,600.00	\$5.00	\$1,250.00	\$22.36	\$5,590.00	\$33.00	\$8,250.00	\$3.00	\$750.00
13	Rock Berm	LF	90	\$33.00	\$2,970.00	\$62.69	\$5,642.10	\$30.00	\$2,700.00	\$55.00	\$4,950.00	\$63.97	\$5,757.30	\$26.00	\$2,340.00	\$92.14	\$8,292.60	\$91.00	\$8,190.00	\$30.00	\$2,700.00
14	Stabilized Construction Entrance	EA	1	\$1,200.00	\$1,200.00	\$1,405.85	\$1,405.85	\$2,500.00	\$2,500.00	\$1,500.00	\$1,500.00	\$3,198.73	\$3,198.73	\$2,250.00	\$2,250.00	\$2,167.87	\$2,167.87	\$2,300.00	\$2,300.00	\$2,000.00	\$2,000.00
15	Silt Fence for Erosion Control	LF	630	\$2.75	\$1,732.50	\$5.15	\$3,244.50	\$10.00	\$6,300.00	\$1.25	\$787.50	\$3.60	\$2,268.00	\$3.50	\$2,205.00	\$7.80	\$4,914.00	\$3.00	\$1,890.00	\$3.00	\$1,890.00
16	Total Mobilization Payment	LS	1	\$13,460.00	\$13,460.00	\$11,870.00	\$11,870.00	\$8,800.00	\$8,800.00	\$11,262.73	\$11,262.73	\$18,080.74	\$18,080.74	\$44,700.00	\$44,700.00	\$13,549.19	\$13,549.19	\$26,000.00	\$26,000.00	\$56,000.00	\$56,000.00
17	C.I.P Project Sign	EA	2	\$1,100.00	\$2,200.00	\$696.73	\$1,393.46	\$900.00	\$1,800.00	\$900.00	\$1,800.00	\$1,274.02	\$2,548.04	\$450.00	\$900.00	\$1,016.19	\$2,032.38	\$1,500.00	\$3,000.00	\$800.00	\$1,600.00
18	Barricades, Signs, and Traffic Handling	MO	3	\$2,500.00	\$6,250.00	\$2,539.52	\$6,348.80	\$1,250.00	\$3,125.00	\$1,500.00	\$3,750.00	\$1,235.75	\$3,089.38	\$3,000.00	\$7,500.00	\$4,742.22	\$11,855.55	\$6,800.00	\$17,000.00	\$3,800.00	\$9,500.00
TOTAL					\$192,940.50		\$231,119.36		\$232,367.60		\$235,536.29		\$244,994.47		\$249,573.00		\$298,901.64		\$325,225.00		\$338,727.00